

Attachment 6

Approved Certificate of Appropriateness & Memorandum of Decision

Town of New Paltz Historic Preservation Commission
Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness

Town of New Paltz Building Department (845) 255-0102 Ext 1
<http://www.townofnewpaltz.org>

For Bldg. Dept. Only		
Application Number: _____	File: _____	Date: _____
Received By: _____		

Instructions

- Type or print clearly with black ink.
- Attach additional sheets for each category as needed to ensure completeness of form.

Applicant's Name: MOHONK PRESERVE, INC.

**If applicant is not owner,
state applicant's relationship to the project:** N/A

Address of applicant: P.O. BOX 715 NEW PALTZ, NY 12561

Telephone Number: 845-255-0919

Property Owner's Name (if different from applicant): SAME AS APPLICANT

Address of property owner: SAME AS APPLICANT

Property Landmark Designation:

NATIONAL HISTORIC LANDMARK DISTRICT & LOCAL HISTORIC LANDMARK

Description of Work:

1. REPAIR & MAINTENANCE OF CLAY TILE ROOF, COPPER FLASHING, TRIM

(See Pages 4-10 of the Conditions Study)

2. REPAIR & MAINTENANCE MASONRY MORTAR POINTING

(See Pages 11-19 of the Conditions Study)

3. REPAIR AND/OR REPLACEMENT OF WINDOWS AND EXTERIOR DOORS

(See Pages 20-23 of the Conditions Study)

By attachment, this application provides the following items:

- *Local Historic Landmark Designation* prepared by the Town of New Paltz Historic Preservation Commission dated 10-15-13.
- *Conditions Study for the Mohonk Preserve Testimonial Gateway* prepared by Crawford & Stearns Architects and Preservation Planners dated September 2013.
- *Stabilization and Restoration Plans for the Mohonk Testimonial Gateway* prepared by Crawford & Stearns Architects and Preservation Planners dated 2-11-15.
- *Property Survey* prepared by Brooks and Brooks Land Surveyors dated October 2014.
- Proposed Window Manufacturer's Specification Sheet

This Certificate of Appropriateness shall be in addition to and not in lieu of any building permit that may be required.

If this Certificate of Appropriateness is approved with conditions, those conditions shall be submitted to the applicant in writing. No decision regarding a Certificate of Appropriateness can be made unless that decision is approved by the Commission as a voting body, and submitted to both the Building Inspector and the applicant in writing:

Date Application Received: 3/18/2015

Date of Commission Review: 3/18/2015

Date of Public Hearing: 4/15/2015

Application was: Approved Denied Approved with Conditions

If the application is approved with conditions, such conditions have been appended to the application and are binding part of the application, in that noncompliance with such conditions constitutes noncompliance with the Certificate of Appropriateness.



Signature of Chair

5/20/15

Date

MEMORANDUM OF DECISION OF THE TOWN OF NEW PALTZ, NEW YORK
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

The undersigned certifies that by decision issued May 20, 2015 by the Historic Preservation Commission of the Town of New Paltz, Ulster County, New York pursuant to the provisions of Article XIV of Chapter 140 of the Code of the Town of New Paltz, the following resolution was adopted with respect to certain proposed changes to the historic structure known as the Mononk Testimonial Gateway, located at the intersection of Route 299 and Gatehouse Road.

Decision of the Town of New Paltz Historic Preservation Commission to Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness Application from Mohonk Preserve Inc., Owner of the Testimonial Gateway and adjacent property

WHEREAS, the structure that is the subject of this application for a Certificate of Appropriateness is an existing structure known as the Mohonk Ceremonial Gatehouse (hereafter the Gatehouse), being situated on an undivided parcel shown on the Tax Map of the Town of New Paltz as S/B/L 86.1-1-40.1 (hereafter the Property);

WHEREAS, the Property is owned by Mohonk Preserve, Inc., (hereafter Owner), having been conveyed to Owner by deed recorded in the Office of the Ulster County Clerk in deed book 5819, Page 125;

WHEREAS the Gatehouse has been designated by the Commission as a local landmark;

WHEREAS Section 140-121.K of the Town Code of the Town of New Paltz authorizes the Commission to review and approve applications for certificates of appropriateness pursuant to the criteria set forth in Article XIV;

WHEREAS, the Owner has submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for certain repair and rehabilitation work on the Gateway building, with supporting documents, including the *Conditions Study for the Mohonk Preserve Testimonial Gateway* prepared by Crawford & Stearns Architects and Preservation Planners dated September 2013 (the "Conditions Study") and *Stabilization and Restoration Plans for the Mohonk Testimonial Gateway* prepared by Crawford & Stearns Architects and Preservation Planners dated May, 2015;

WHEREAS, the supporting documentation describes the location of property; provide a detailed description of the proposed changes; include perspective and elevation drawings of the building; show the relationship of the building to adjacent properties; include photographs of property; provide samples of the colors and/or materials to be used for the work; and

WHEREAS, the applicant requests a Certificate of Appropriateness for the following work:

1. Repair and maintenance of clay tile roof, copper flashing, trim
(See Pages 4-10 of the Conditions Study)

2. Repair and maintenance masonry mortar pointing
(See Pages 11-19 of the Conditions Study)
3. Repair and/or replacement of windows and exterior doors
(See Pages 20-23 of the Conditions Study)

WHEREAS, the applicant represents that the roof will be replaced with tiles manufactured from the same molds as the original tiles, such that the work is essentially a replacement in kind;

WHEREAS, the applicant represents that the work in Item will be done with similar materials to the original masonry work, and further represents that it will utilize Rosendale cement or the naturally hydraulic like equivalent in the repair work if it is available at the time the work is done, such that the work is essentially a replacement in kind;

WHEREAS, the applicant has provided the Commission with details of the proposed window replacement, and has represented that it will retain and repair those elements of the original window components that survive;

WHEREAS, the Commission is aware that the Owner has made separate application for land use approval for a project known as the Mohonk Foothills project;

WHEREAS, that application will be referred to the Commission for its review and recommendations with respect to the impact, if any, of that proposed project on matters within the jurisdiction of the Commission, pursuant to Section 140-123.D. of the Town Code;

WHEREAS, the application before the Commission at this time proposes ordinary repair and maintenance work that is necessary to repair and rehabilitate the existing structure to prevent its deterioration, and the Commission notes that the owner of a historic property is required by Section 140-123.D to take action to prevent a historic structure from falling into disrepair, including repair of the the roof, mortar, broken windows and other features that could result in demolition; and

WHEREAS, the work allowed by this Certificate of Appropriateness is required pursuant to Section 140-123., and does not include physical disturbance of the land that is the subject of the Foothills project, and would have to be undertaken whether or not the Foothills project is approved;

WHEREAS, nothing in this application will preclude the Commission from undertaking a full review of the Foothills project at such time as it may be referred to the Commission, or in any way preclude the Commission from recommending modification of any aspect of the Foothills project ;

WHEREAS, the repair, renovation and rehabilitation that will be authorized by this Certificate of Appropriateness is considered a SEQR Type II action, not requiring further SEQR review; and

WHEREAS, representatives of the applicant ,who will be responsible for supervising the conduct of the repair and rehabilitation of the Work submitted plans and details on Feb. 7, 2015, presented to the Commission at its March 18, 2015 meeting , and attended the public hearing held on April 15, 2015; and

WHEREAS, public notice was given of the public hearing to review the Certificate of Appropriateness by means of newspaper (New Paltz Times), New Paltz Historic Preservation Commission website, and abutter notification by postal mail; and

WHEREAS, the public hearing was convened on April 15, 2015 to allow public comment concerning the proposed work on the exterior of the Testimonial Gateway structure , and closed on the same date;

WHEREAS, the Commission has considered the application with due consideration of the criteria set forth in Section § 140-124 for approval of certificate of appropriateness.

WHEREAS, the Commission is mindful that its review authority does not include changes to interior spaces.

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Commission, on consideration of the application and the record before the Commission:

1. finds and determines that the proposed repair work is a Type II SEQRA action, and no further environmental review of that work is required.
2. finds and determines that the proposed repair work is essential to prevent further deterioration in this important historical building and allow it to maintain its structural integrity. The Commission finds that the proposed work will retain the historic features of the building with commendable fidelity, insofar as materials and methods are available to the Owner. The Commission finds that the style, color and material of the replacement windows proposed by the applicant will minimally alter the appearance and character of the Testimonial Gateway building, and that the extent of the alteration is as little as possible.
3. The Commission finds that the proposed repair and renovation work is compatible with the historic character of the Gateway building. The use of similar or identical materials for the roof and masonry repair maintain the significant historical, architectural and cultural character of the Gateway building and its environs, as will the applicant's willingness to retain and repair existing elements of the windows. The Commission recognizes that many of the windows in the building have deteriorated over time, that NYS Energy Code standards have been upgraded, and that windows are not available that would allow the applicant to replace the original windows with identical windows. The Commission has considered the proposed replacement windows, as presented in the supporting documentation, and finds that the replacements are similar in visual appearance, and incorporate material and design that is compatible with the size, scale, color, material and character of the building, its setting in the landscape, the surrounding neighborhood and environment, as evidenced by comments from the public at the public hearing.

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that by vote of the Commissioners attending the New Paltz Historic Preservation Commission meeting on May 20, 2015, recorded below, the Commission approved the Certificate of Appropriateness, finding and determines that the proposed changes meet the requirements for approval and preserve the historical character of the structure.

This decision shall be provided to the Town Clerk, the Town Building Department and a copy of the decision shall be sent by registered mail to the property owner.

Commission Member	Vote (Aye or Nay)
John Orfitelli, Chair	Yes
Helen Christie, Vice-Chair	Absent
David Gilmour, AICP	Absent
Caryn Sobel	Yes
Dawn Elliott	Yes

This memorandum is furnished for recording pursuant to the provisions contained at Subdivision D of Section 140-122, "Certificate of Appropriateness" of Article XIV of Chapter 140 of the Code of the Town of New Paltz.

This Certificate of Appropriateness is granted in addition to, and not in lieu of, any building permit that may be required.

Certified as correct this 20th day of May, 2015.



John Orfitelli, Chair
Town of New Paltz Historic Preservation Commission